

we threw our 'new' ideas and methods overboard." Samuel Adler, a department chairman at the Eastman School of Music and composer for the synagogue, proceeds farther with Mr. Batastini's "respectably crafted" caveat, noting that it was typical in times past to put tunes and other musical ideas from popular sources through a religious conversion by which they became sacred; then: "I contend with you that this is where our civilization differs. We are leaving the popular culture in its own vernacular." He quotes the pianist Mel Powell, who said, "It is reprehensible to call the unadorned colloquial, sacred." These excerpts are an undoubtedly biased sampling of the commentaries and reminiscences in this collection; however, the scope of the originals is broad enough to support a wide range of different biases, with good company and stimuli to thought.

DONALD CADWELL

The Reform of the Liturgy 1948-1975 by Annibale Bugnini, tr. by Matthew J. O'Connell. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1990. xxxiii, 974 pp.; hardback, \$59.50.

Recently Archbishop Rembert Weakland of Milwaukee, one of a handful of American reformers responsible for the present state of the Catholic liturgy in the United States, expressed doubt about the reform, its organization and its results. Well he might, with the debacle visible on every side and the results of the liturgical "renewal" that continue to add daily to the devastation of the Church, its discipline, its teachings, its schools and religious life—in a word, every aspect of ecclesiastical life.

If one wants to see how the process began and developed, Archbishop Bugnini's book provides a detailed and complete account of the years preceding the council and on until 1975. In reading the sad story, one wonders whether the reaction of incredulity or the passion of anger or the emotion of sorrow with tears should dominate. What so few did to so many prompts unbelief; that a thousand year tradition should be destroyed causes anger; that a sublime means of prayer should be swept away brings tears.

Bugnini tells all, and not without openly expressing emotion and opinion. For a mine of information concerning the characters involved in the various pre-conciliar study bodies, the prelates and periti who constituted the various commissions and committees, the book is excellent. The account of the meetings and the developments in liturgical matters before, during and after the council is a carefully documented record. The politics and misunderstanding, the scheming and quarrelling, the alignment of sides and the ultimate emergence of what today is called the reformed liturgy of the II Vatican Council do not edify anyone.

Of course, there are "good guys" and "bad guys" according to Bugnini's story. The "bad guys" are the church musicians and those wishing to retain some use of the Latin language, conservatives who evoke the anger and sarcasm of the author because of their efforts to defend the heritage of the Church in its liturgical texts and the musical settings from Gregorian chant to modern compositions. Bugnini attributes bad will to many of those sitting with him on the various commissions, especially the members of the *Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae*. Among those singled out for special objection are Monsignor Iginio Anglès, president of the Pontifical Institute of Sacred Music in Rome, and Monsignor Johannes Overath, president of the papally founded *Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae*.

On the other side were the "good guys" who promoted the same agenda as Bugnini. Among them were Johannes Wagner of Trier, Frederick McManus of Washington, Joseph Gelineau, Pierre Journel, A. G. Martimort, Cipriano Vagaggini, Rembert Weakland and Godfrey Diekmann. That there existed an international conspiracy among these liturgists has often been suggested but never proved, least of all from what is recorded in Bugnini's accounts. According to the original plan of procedure to be followed by the council, the treatment of the liturgy was to come after the consideration of the Church. *Lumen gentium* should have been clearly established before *Sacrosanctum concilium* could be logically taken up and its decrees ordered. Indeed, since the Church is the living presence of Jesus Christ, then the actions of that Church (its liturgy) must flow from the divine Person, its very head. With the rejection of the initial documents of the pre-conciliar committees, to occupy the assembled bishops while the documents were rewritten, the discussion of the liturgy was illogically thrust into first place without adequate theological consideration of its very nature, the salvific action of Jesus Christ. Little wonder that the externals became so important and in the minds of many continue to constitute the main work of the council.

This massive volume, written by Bugnini during his "exile" in Iran, with almost infinite detail, is divided into ten parts. The first part, called "The Main Stages," gives a brief account of the beginning of the reform, the preparatory commissions, the constitution on the liturgy, its fundamental principles, the *motu proprio*, *Sacram liturgiam*, and the Sacred Congregation for Divine Worship. It continues to recount the "First Accomplishments" including the shift from Latin to the various vernacular languages, changes in the missals, and concelebration. Also considered in the first part, under the subtitle, "Two Areas of Activity," are the meetings themselves, the observers, and the conferences with various national liturgical experts, the question of translation, the es-

tablishment of the journal *Notitiae*, the phenomenon of experimentation with the liturgy, and finally a most interesting section on the opposition to the plans of Bugnini, where the author fully reveals himself.

Part II treats the new liturgical books and the calendar. Part III is on the missal, the lectionary, Eucharistic prayers and Masses with special groups including children. Part IV considers the liturgy of the hours and Part V, the sacraments. Part VI has to do with blessings, including religious profession, funerals, the ritual and the pontifical. Part VII undertakes the simplification of pontifical rites both papal and episcopal. Part VIII accounts for special documents, including the instructions for carrying out the constitution on the liturgy, the subject of liturgy in seminaries, the worship of the Eucharistic mystery and finally veneration of the Blessed Virgin. Part IX is on sacred music and the 1967 instruction, *Musicam sacram*, again another struggle between the liturgists and the musicians. Part X is called "Varia." The finale is Bugnini's *apologia pro vita sua*, "We tried to serve the Church. . ."

The effects of the Second Vatican Council will be felt for many years to come. This book is a useful compilation of data on the specific area of liturgical reform. Unfortunately it is marred by the personal opinions and prejudiced position of its author who never ceases to grind his knives against those who had every right to express their opinions in the halls of the council committees. One continually has the feeling that full sincerity is not present in sections dealing with musical matters. Too often organizations such as *Universa Laus* and such persons as Joseph Gelineau are employed to circumvent the established and traditional positions of the majority of church musicians represented by the *Consociatio Internationalis Musicae Sacrae* and the Pontifical School of Music in Rome. In this country, the work (conspiracy?) was carried forward by the actions of Rembert Weakland, Godfrey Diekmann and Frederick McManus who controlled the process of implementation of the decrees recorded by Bugnini, largely through their positions on the American bishops' committees for implementing the decrees of the council. The results are the sad state of the Catholic Church in this country today, so sad that even those who set it in motion are beginning to have doubts.

The translation from Italian reads well. The book is attractively printed and well indexed. It is an important compilation of facts and materials, but always there remains throughout the presence of Bugnini, his bias, his anger, and his prejudice, making one continue to ask the unanswerable question, "Why?"

R.J.S.

Recordings

Maundy Thursday. Monastic Choir of St. Peter's Abbey, Solesmes, directed by Dom Jean Claire, O.S.B. Distributed in North America by Paraclete Press, P. O. Box 1568, Orleans, MA 02653. 1989. Playing time: 65:05. Compact disc, \$15.98; cassette, \$8.98.

The original French title of this recent release, *La Messe Concélébrée du Jeudi Saint à l'Abbaye de Solesmes*, provides a concise summary of its contents. Once again, the choirmaster and choir of Saint Peter's Abbey demonstrate their mastery of Gregorian chant and the current developments regarding its interpretation.

Normally, one would expect to hear the Mass propers and perhaps parts of the ordinary sung in a recording such as this. Those who planned it, however, seem to have taken a lesson from *Saint Agnes Sunday Morning* (Leaflet Missal Co., 976 W. Minnehaha Avenue, Saint Paul, MN 55104). Included besides the full proper and ordinary are the greeting and penitential rite, opening prayer, all the scripture readings, prayer of the faithful, prayer over the gifts, preface, Eucharistic prayer I, *Pater noster* and communion rite, prayer after communion, and *Pange lingua*. All of these are sung in Latin according to the appropriate tones. Even the *Orate, fratres* is sung.

Choir and soloists sing their respective parts with care and skill. The recording will move and instruct, entertain and inform.

The selection of tones, when choices are possible, and the assignment of roles to the singers hint at the vast musical and liturgical resources available. For instance, the prayer of the faithful is the second litany from the booklet, *Litaniae in cantu*. The concelebrants probably sang their parts from the *Liber concelebrantium*, and the *Pater noster* is the rarely heard but lovely Tone C from the *Graduale*. Uncharacteristic of Solesmes, however, is that many of the responses (*Amen*, *Et cum spiritu tuo*, and so forth) seem flat, but the more complicated selections are perfect. Perhaps this can be explained by the nature of digital recordings, a different composition of the choir for the responses, or some variable of time or place.

The booklet published along with the compact disc is comprehensive to a fault, partly because its texts are presented in Latin, French, English, German, Spanish and Italian. Because of its unusual thickness, the booklet barely fits into its slot in the CD case. Nevertheless, it contains, among many other things, musical and liturgical commentaries of uncommon insight contributed by an anonymous author. These can make listening even more enjoyable and fruitful.

Since this album is titled *Maundy Thursday* instead of *Holy Thursday*, it is curious that the anti-

FROM THE EDITORS

Archbishop Annibale Bugnini

With the publication of the English translation of Archbishop Bugnini's *The Reform of the Liturgy 1948-1975*, the wounds and rancor of the council years are revived. The book recounts the battles and misunderstandings between the reforming liturgists and the church musicians. Bugnini himself said that the first ten years following the close of the council were no more than continual fighting with the musicians.

It is never right to impute motives or to attribute ill will, but occasionally such things surface in the records. Surely Bugnini's opposition to the classical heritage of sacred music and the Latin language shows in this work. True, it is disguised under the need for participation of the faithful, understanding of the texts, and simplification of the rites, truly noble objectives of the council fathers. But after devastating the traditions and heritage of a thousand years of musical and liturgical development, there cannot be much remaining on which to encourage any kind of true participation, and understanding and simplification have little left to build on or work with.

An anti-Roman spirit, manifest especially in attacks on Latin as the language of the universal Church, constantly raises its head. One always wonders why Latin was considered to be competitive with the vernacular. Surely the creation of a repertory of vernacular choral music demands that it be constructed on the foundation of the treasury of Latin compositions.

The mere simplification of church music results in the abandoning of music as an art especially in its polyphonic developments, eliminating the masterpieces that have adorned the liturgy for a millenium. A rationalism that demands understanding of every word as essential to active participation, forgetting the moving of man's spirit by the mystery and beauty of music, drives the text into an unreasonably prominent position in liturgical celebration, almost to the total elimination of the art of sacred music, which must be united to the text to form the artistic whole that liturgical music must be. The impoverished translations of the Latin texts into English added an enormous burden to the effort to promote participation of the people as well as understanding of the vernacular texts.

Basic to the conflict between the liturgists and the musicians is a failure to understand clearly the meaning of *actuosa participatio populi* that the council called for. If indeed singing of pieces by everyone constitutes the epitome of participation, then the art of music in the service of the liturgy is destined for extinction. In 1965, the Fifth International Church Music Congress, meeting in Chicago and Milwaukee, considered the meaning of that concept. A paper by Father Colman E. O'Neill, O.P., (*Sacred Music and Liturgy Reform after Vatican II*, Rome, 1969, p. 89-108) clearly distinguishes between internal and external participation, and indicates that singing is only one of many means of external participation, not to mention listening.

Just as basic to the struggle between the liturgists and the musicians was a false sense of ecumenism, a problem that surfaced not only in the liturgical discussions but in many other areas considered by the council fathers. Efforts made to restructure the Catholic liturgy into Protestant-like services grew out of this error and met with opposition from many Catholic sources. Even Bugnini takes up this criticism with reference to the activity of the Protestant monks of Taizé whose influence in preparing the reforms remains a mystery.

The conflicts that began in the council commissions and continued in the years

FROM THE EDITORS

following are not dead. Church music lies in a shambles not only in this country but throughout the world, largely as a result of the work of Bugnini. The church musicians have withdrawn from the fray; as a result hardly anything of any value has been forthcoming in the last twenty-five years in composition or performance. The liturgists for their part have produced nothing but an on-going series of vaudeville acts, experiments and novelties; liturgy has become associated with entertainment (dancing, combos, even costuming), so each week must be different, a new act.

When one considers the great hope that the Second Vatican Council initiated and how we looked forward to the promise of new music for the vernacular languages, the integral part that music would have in the liturgy (*pars integrans*), the freedom to use all styles that were truly art and truly sacred, the call for new music for both Latin and vernacular liturgical texts, the demand that music be written both for congregations and for choirs, the extension of the permission to employ all serious instruments, the encouragement of musicological studies and particularly the advancement of Gregorian chant with the publication of new chant books—all this is what the council fathers ordered and the church musicians hoped to implement. The preservation of tradition along with a natural development of means for active participation and the use of the vernacular were the contribution of the church musicians to the council documents, especially *Sacrosanctum concilium*. They fought against Bugnini and his allies to keep the art of music in its centuries old role in the liturgy. They fought to maintain it in the writings of the post-conciliar period, especially in *Musicam sacram* of 1967, and the fight continues as liturgists continue to insert themselves into the field of sacred music. Cooperation between liturgists and musicians is still a state to be fondly hoped for, but it was not the spirit of Annibale Bugnini as his book shows so clearly.

R.J.S.

Copyright, A Moral Problem

The United States government in the copyright law of 1976 has established protection for composers and publishers in the face of the great growth of copying machines which constitute an ever-present temptation to duplicate copies of printed, published music. The laws protecting the rights of composers and publishers are enforced by grave penalties and heavy fines leveled against those who violate the statutes knowingly or even unintentionally.

But there is more involved here than mere penal laws. It is not simply a matter of not being caught. For a person with a rightly formed conscience, there is the basic question of justice, the giving to each person his due. This binds in conscience, and violations of the law are offenses against one's neighbor and therefore against God. Injustice is involved, and restitution is demanded for the loss suffered and the rights infringed upon. As Christians and church musicians, dedicated to the service of God in His worship, we must not be involved in actions that are contrary to God and His justice, the very God whom we profess to adore.

Recently the Music Publishers' Association of the United States (130 West 57th Street, New York, N.Y. 10019) issued some concise summaries of the copyright laws. These are available from that organization. One has an obligation to inform himself in these matters. Ignorance of the law is no excuse for violation of it. Our American bishops have repeatedly reminded us of the duty of obedience in copyright matters. Court cases directed against the Church because of copyright infringements have been costly.



SACRED MUSIC

Volume 117, Number 3, Fall 1990

FROM THE EDITORS	
Archbishop Annibale Bugnini	3
Copyright, a Moral Problem	4
The Demise of <i>Gregoriana</i>	5
CATHOLIC PRACTICES AND RECAPTURING THE SACRED	6
John M. Haas	
WILL BEAUTY LOOK AFTER HERSELF?	15
Giles R. Dimock, O.P.	
THE TRAINING OF A CHURCH MUSICIAN	18
Monsignor Richard J. Schuler	
REVIEWS	21
NEWS	27
CONTRIBUTORS	28