

A 1949 book by Justine Ward.

These statements are false :

When the Vatican Commission met to edit the *Kyriale*, there were differences of opinion and differences of taste among the members. One party, the majority, was in favor of restoring the melodies to their original form as found in the most ancient and authentic manuscripts. The minority favored compromise, the adoption of forms more familiar to modern ears and which they called a “living tradition”. The discussion was lively. Finally, the President of the Commission was authorized to make the decisions and ruled in favor of the “compromise” melodies. These became the official melodies of the Church and, undoubtedly will remain so for many years to come.

The monks of Solesmes had been in the ranks of those who favored an integral restoration of the melodies. Nevertheless, they bowed before the decision of the Holy See and reproduced the *Kyriale* in its “compromise” form which had become official. For the use of their own Order and for the benefit of those others who might wish to profit by their science, they added the rhythmic signs (the Holy See having ruled that these signs should remain the exclusive property of the Benedictine monks of Solesmes), but in publishing the *Kyriale*, the worm turned just a fraction of a millimeter. Those dates printed at the right of each piece show clearly whether the piece in question was reproduced integrally or whether it was a hodgepodge (a bit gleaned from this century, a bit from that), or whether, again, it was a piece that could not be found in any manuscript whatever. In the latter case, we see a blank at the right (pp. 45, 53, 66, 87, 88). Almost all of these melodies are sung at Solesmes, even the poorest, but the latter are selected to use during Lent as an artistic penance. Thus all things can be made to serve a purpose!

As a matter of fact, Justine Ward (in her mistaken zeal to attack the official edition) inadvertently attacks the method of Dom Mocquereau himself. Dom Mocquereau placed all the different versions in a comparative chart and took little bits and pieces of different sections. He was criticized for this during his life because people pointed out that he was creating a version that “had never been sung anywhere by anyone.”

THIS NEW COLLECTION, with its marvelous CHORAL SUPPLEMENT and 3-volume (spiral bound) ORGAN ACCOMPANIMENT, has been described as “the peerless and indispensable resource for any parish musician serious about authentic Catholic music.” • <https://ccwatershed.org/hymn/>